



**MINUTES OF THE  
GLENDALE CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
2011 INSTALLATION CEREMONY  
Council Chambers, 5850 West Glendale Avenue  
January 11, 2011  
7:00 p.m.**

The meeting was called to order by Mayor Elaine M. Scruggs, with Vice Mayor Steven E. Frate and the following Councilmembers present: Joyce V. Clark, Yvonne J. Knaack, H. Philip Lieberman, Manuel D. Martinez and Councilmember-Elect Norma S. Alvarez.

Also present were Ed Beasley, City Manager; Horatio Skeete, Assistant City Manager; Craig Tindall, City Attorney; Pamela Hanna, City Clerk.

The "Presentation of Colors" was performed by The Luke Air Force Base, Honor Guard.

The "National Anthem" was performed by Staff Sgt. Alisha Pasco, Luke Air Force Base. The pledge of allegiance was recited.

Mayor Scruggs presented the following prepared comments:

Good Evening. Welcome to the January 11, 2011 meeting of the Glendale City Council.

The agenda for tonight's meeting is simple. To administer the oath of office to three Glendale residents - each elected by residents of the districts in which they live - to represent all residents of the city of Glendale.

Their duties are the same as voted upon in 1957 when Glendale residents approved the government of the city of Glendale as a Home Rule city. "All powers of the city, not in conflict with the constitution and subject to the limitations of this charter, shall be vested in the council, who shall enact appropriate legislation and do and perform any and all acts and things which may be necessary and proper to carry out these powers or any of the provisions of

this charter.” It all sounds very dry and bureaucratic when read aloud but when put into practice in real life is alive, dynamic, and sometimes dangerous. On last Saturday, January 8, it was very, very dangerous for 20 Arizonans. Please join me in reflecting for a few moments on the events of last Saturday.

I ask that you think about Dorothy Morris, age 76, married 54 years to her high school sweetheart, George. Dorothy and George Morris went to Congresswoman Gabrielle Gifford’s Congress on the Corner event in Tucson last Saturday, only to be caught in the line of fire. Dorothy was declared dead on the scene, and her husband is in critical condition.

I ask that you think about Dorwin Stoddard, age 76. Dorwin Stoddard died while shielding his wife Mavy from the barrage of bullets in Tucson last Saturday. Dorwin and Mavy have been active in ministry at their church helping the sick and homeless. They were at the supermarket last Saturday because Mavy wanted to tell Congresswoman Giffords she was doing a good job. Mavy was shot several times in the leg but her beloved husband, Dorwin, did save her life - while giving up his own.

I ask that you think about Phyllis Schneck, age 79, a widow who spent summers in New Jersey and winters in Tucson. Phyllis Schneck had recently listened to Congresswoman Giffords on a conference call and had gone to the Congress on the Corner event hoping to shake Giffords’ hand.

I ask that you think about Christina Greene, age 9. Christina was excited about the political process. She was a member of the student council at her school and went to the Congress on the Corner event to learn more about the political process. Christina Greene’s life ended on Saturday, January 8.

I ask that you think about Judge John Roll, federal judge for the District of Arizona since 1991. Judge Roll began his career as a bailiff in the Pima County Superior Court. He served as an assistant city attorney for Tucson, a deputy city attorney for Pima County, and numerous other judicial positions prior to joining the U. S. Attorney’s Office. Judge Roll was a friend and supporter of Congresswoman Giffords’. He was killed Saturday, January 8 when he stopped by Congresswoman Giffords’ event to say hello.

As you think about these innocent Tucson residents, I ask that you think about how similar they are to you. You are all here because you know and support one or more of the members of the Glendale City Council. You are here because you care about the City of Glendale. You care about the important issues facing governments everywhere and you want to be part of the process to do what is right and what is best for the most people. Many of you attend my Community Conversations and the Councilmembers’ District Meetings - which are the same type of event as Gabrielle Giffords’ Congress on the Corner.

You are not much different from Dorothy Morris, Dorwin Stoddard, Phyllis Schneck, Christina Greene and John Roll.

I ask that you also think about Gabe Zimmerman, age 30. Gabe was the Director of Community Outreach for Congresswoman Giffords. He was a master's degree social worker who handled thousands of constituent matters, from questions about Medicare to benefits for veterans. Gabe Zimmerman did his job exceedingly well. Gabe Zimmerman lost his life on Saturday, January 8.

I ask that you think about how many times you have seen City of Glendale staff members from the Councilmembers' offices and from my office out setting up tables and chairs, asking people to sign registration sheets, providing assistance as requested - all on their own time usually in evenings or on weekends. They, too, are loyal to the City of Glendale and those they represent.

There are countless other staff members who attend the Councilmembers' District Meetings to present information, answer your questions, hear your opinions, and help solve problems you may be experiencing.

Our Glendale staff members are no different in what they do than Gabe Zimmerman. It would be understandable if they now have second thoughts about whether they feel comfortable being in the situations they are often asked to be in. Our City Manager, Ed Beasley, will have to carefully consider their concerns and make decisions in everyone's best interest.

I ask that you consider Congresswoman Gabrielle Giffords, age 40, who served us as a member of the Arizona House of Representatives from 2001 – 2003 and as a member of the Arizona Senate from 2003 – 2005. At the time of her Congress on the Corner event last Saturday, Gabby Giffords was serving Arizona as a member of the U. S. House of Representatives, 8th Congressional District - an office to which she had been elected in 2007.

Congresswoman Giffords was out doing what you want all elected officials to do - be accessible to you at times and places convenient for you - be prepared to hear your concerns and answer your questions - understand and represent you on issues most important to you.

Today Congresswoman Giffords and 13 other individuals lay injured in hospitals.

Finally, I ask that each of you observe a moment of silence and respect for the 20 individuals whose lives were either taken or forever changed on Saturday, January 8, 2011, as they tried to participate in our representative form of government.

Tonight we are gathered to congratulate, support, and encourage three Glendale citizens who have offered themselves in the service of others. Before I turn this

program over to our emcee, I want to recognize others who are with us tonight who have also been elected by you to represent you.

Glendale Vice Mayor and Sahuaro District Councilmember Steve Frate

Councilmember Phil Lieberman elected from Glendale's Cactus District

Councilmember Joyce Clark elected from Glendale's Yucca District

Former Glendale Mayor and retired Justice of the Peace Quentin Tolby

Former Glendale Vice mayor and Glendale Barrel District Councilmember Tom Eggleston

Former Glendale Elementary School District Governing Board President and former Glendale Yucca District Councilmember Martin Samaniego

I want to also introduce a man who is not in elected office but who definitely has dedicated his life to service to us - Brig. Gen. J. D. Harris, Commander of the 56th Fighter Wing at Luke Air Force Base.

Public service is a noble profession. We choose it because we believe in public service. We believe in people. We believe we can help make people's lives better in various ways.

We must continue to believe - and to be available and accessible. We must do so with courage and with reasonable caution.

We must use our actions to encourage you to participate in all matters - not just the ones where you think something might happen that you don't like and we must all renew and strengthen our commitment to communicate with courtesy and civility.

This was the end of Mayor Scruggs prepared comments.

Mayor Scruggs invited Ms. Julie Watters to the podium to proceed as the Mistress of Ceremonies this evening.

Ms. Watters welcomed everyone to the Installation Ceremony for the Glendale City Councilmembers. She stated this ceremony was part ritual, part tradition and part celebration. She stated it was a tradition that has taken place over the course of the country's history, from civic and religious leaders, to those in education and public safety. She explained that at today's Installation Ceremony, three elected Glendale officials will be formally sworn into office and bestowed the powers and responsibilities

outlined in the City Charter. The Councilmembers will be given the opportunity to share their vision and their priorities for the City of Glendale while they are in office.

### **OATH OF OFFICE – MANUEL D. MARTINEZ**

The Honorable Quentin V. Tolby, Judge Pro-Tempore, Maricopa County Justice Courts, Administered the Oath of Office to Manuel D. Martinez, Councilmember Cholla District.

Councilmember Martinez thanked everyone for attending tonight. He stated after Mayor Scruggs' eloquent words, his words seem inconsequential. He stated he was excited and honored, even if this was his fifth time taking the Oath of Office. He noted he wanted to thank the 5,252 Cholla residents who made this possible.

Councilmember Martinez thanked his wife Mary, his bed-rock, his sons David and Manny Jr. as well as the rest of his family, friends, volunteers and campaign donors. He thanked Judge Tolby for once again taking the time to administer the oath.

Councilmember Martinez stated he has been fortunate to have served in the Glendale City Council during the good times and what he considers to be the most exciting period in the city's history. He realizes no one is indispensable, but he chose to run because he did not want to leave when times were not so good.

Councilmember Martinez noted that they face many challenges but there were three issues he would like to touch-on, which were very important. The first one was the arena and the Coyotes, second the budget, and third the Tohono O'odham Tribe application to place 135 acres of land on 91<sup>st</sup> and Glendale Avenues in trust with the Department of Interior to create a reservation with the intent to build a casino. The application was later amended to 54 acres. He noted he will not go into much detail; however, would like to touch on these three issues.

Councilmember Martinez stated that with respect to the arena and Coyotes, the Council adopted ordinances on December 14<sup>th</sup>, approving the arena lease and management agreement, a use and non-relocation agreement, an acquisition of parking rights and revenues and authorizing the sale of municipal property corporation excise tax revenue bonds. He noted in his heart, he knows this was the right decision.

Councilmember Martinez stated one of his favorite quotes was from Theodore Hesburg, former president of The University of Notre Dame who said, "My basic principal is that you don't make decisions because they are easy, you don't make them because they are popular, you don't make them because they are cheap, you make

them because they're right." He remarked he firmly believes the Council made the right decision.

Councilmember Martinez said, with respect to the budget, their budget for fiscal year 08/09 was \$925 million and two years later, it is now \$676 million, a decrease of \$249 million. However, with good planning and sacrificing by a lot of folks, the City Manager, Staff and the Innovation Team, having done a great job with less, as well as employees volunteering to go on 13 day furloughs and this year having to take involuntary furloughs with a 5% cut, they have managed well.

Councilmember Martinez also acknowledged the sacrifice of the police officers and fire fighters. He stated the next budget will be coming up very soon. He noted it will be difficult, but he thinks manageable. He remarked a big concern was that given the enormous state budget deficit, if state revenues were decreased, it will pose a serious problem.

Councilmember Martinez stated, in respect to the O'odham Tribe application, on April 7<sup>th</sup> 2010, the City Council passed Resolution 4246, opposing the creation of an Indian Reservation on a parcel within the Glendale municipal planning area. He stated in July 2010, the Department of Interior approved the Tribe's application to take 42 acres into trust and in September 2010, the City of Glendale sued the Department of Interior's decision. He noted if this application is not overturned in the courts, this would mean a sovereign nation coming into the City of Glendale can build anything they want, including a casino. They would pay no state, county or city taxes. He noted there would be millions of dollars in costs to Glendale residents, and the private sector which has invested millions of dollars in Westgate and surrounding areas would be at a severe competitive disadvantage.

Councilmember Martinez stated the Gila River Indian Tribe has also filed a suit against the application. He stated Governor Brewer, Congressman Franks, Senators Kyl and McCain, as well as several legislators were also opposed. He noted Mr. William R. Rhodes, Gila River Indian Communities Governor, summed this up in one sentence. He quoted, "We believe that the Tohono O'odham's Nation, with the assistance of the federal government, has disrespected the rule of law, the balance so carefully struck among Indian gaming tribes, our community, Glendale, and every Arizonan."

Councilmember Martinez stated in regard to the economy, it was still down, but there are some positives to talk about. He acknowledged new firms like Humana, a Fortune 500 Company, which opened an office in Westgate, as did Devry University. He added the U.S. Marshall's Office and an Assistant Living Center also located in

Glendale as well as others. He stated a remarkable statistic he heard from staff was that Glendale filled more than one million square feet of industrial and office space last year. In addition, business expansion has added hundreds of jobs, including Arrowhead Hospital, Banner Thunderbird Hospital, Coca Cola and Conair.

He added that Midwestern University, in the past year, completed a \$150 million expansion that included a dental and optometry clinic. Councilmember Martinez stated when they first opened in 1996, they had a staff of 19 and 144 students; today they have 29 buildings, over 500 in staff and over 2,400 students, as well as being the largest medical school in the state.

Councilmember Martinez stated he was proud of the many achievements of the Council especially in dealing with these tough economic times with minimal impact to services and the avoidance of massive layoffs.

Councilmember Martinez acknowledge his colleagues, staff, especially City Manager, Mr. Beasley, Assistant City Manager Mr. Skeete, City Attorney, Mr. Tindall, City Manager, Mr. Colson, and Financial Advisor, Mr. Lynch. He also acknowledged the good work done by their City Judge, Ms. Elizabeth Finn and City Clerk, Ms. Pam Hanna.

Councilmember Martinez recognized the contributions of Councilmember Goulet and congratulated Mrs. Alvarez on her election. He looks forward to working with her for a better Glendale.

Councilmember Martinez closed his speech by stating he was the eternal optimist. He noted his pledge was to work as hard as ever, to provide the best quality of life for all the citizens of Glendale. He thanked everyone once again for attending.

### **OATH OF OFFICE – YVONNE J. KNAACK**

The Honorable Elizabeth Finn, Presiding City Judge, Glendale City Court, Administered the Oath of Office to Yvonne J. Knaack, Councilmember Barrel District.

Councilmember Knaack welcomed everyone to City Hall. She said it was wonderful to see so many people here.

Councilmember Knaack stated after the tragedy Saturday in Tucson, she did not really feel like giving a speech or celebrating, but she was sure Congresswomen Giffords' would say "get on with it" so she would like this opportunity to publicly acknowledge the people who have supported her and Glendale.

Councilmember Knaack first thanked her family. She thanked her husband David, in attendance tonight. She thanked her daughters, Seanna, Jessica and Kali, her stepdaughter Kathy who supported her from Texas with her husband, Matt and granddaughter Charley. She thanked her 91 year old mother who is watching on Channel 11. She thanked her brother, Gary, his wife JoDee, her nephews and niece, her father-in-law, Don Knaack and all the Knaack family. She thanked her grandchildren, Zachary, Devin and Kaydance. She thanked her office staff both at State Farm and Council Office. She also thanked the many longtime friends she has here. She stated she was truly blessed.

Councilmember Knaack stated that the last four years have brought some significant decisions in the city and she acknowledged her fellow Councilmembers, including Councilmember Goulet and especially Mayor Elaine Scruggs for being so conscientious in leading the City of Glendale. She indicated the city was respected worldwide.

Next, she applauded city staff from management to each department. These were the most incredibly talented, hardworking and innovative people, you could ever wish to have taking care of business. They initiated a program called Innovate that has saved the city a lot of time and money and has allowed employees to be a part of the solution of keeping the city running at the highest level in these tough economic times. She stated they were a customer service organization and should be proud of what has been accomplished; no one does it better than their police and fire departments. She thanked Chief Conrad and Chief Burdick for their support and leadership.

Councilmember Knaack noted their neighborhoods were top priority. Her goal is to support the health and safety of their residents. She stated the residents and volunteers are the real assets of the city. She stated many of them are on the 19 Boards and Commissions that help the Council make appropriate decisions affecting them all. She noted their other assets were their non-profit organizations. She stated she was involved with the Kiwanis Club of Glendale, The Salvation Army, The Glendale/Peoria YMCA, The YWCA and the Glendale Family Development Center. She also acknowledged the Rotary Clubs, The Soroptomists, The Lions, The Glendale Historical Society, Glendale Women's Club and The Glendale Civic Pride Ambassadors. She noted all of these organizations make Glendale a better place to live. She added she would be remiss if she did not thank their Veteran Organizations, The American Legion, The Disabled American Veterans and The Veterans of Foreign Wars. She thanked all the men and women for their service.

Councilmember Knaack stated that as a State Farm agent and property owner downtown, she supports the Centerline Project and will work diligently to see it comes to fruition. She acknowledged all the business owners and the Glendale Chamber of Commerce. She would like to see funding restored to the Visual Improvement Program and other programs that help small businesses succeed. She also thanked corporate businesses, and their medical and education communities for their continued support of

Glendale. The quality of service provided to residents depends on tax revenue, employment and investments from these entities.

Councilmember Knaack noted that as Chairman of Glendale's Sustainability Committee, she has been awed by what their staff has done to make Glendale socially, economically and environmentally sustainable in the future.

Councilmember Knaack stated she has lived in the West Valley for 50 years and knows the future for this region is unlimited. She remarked that they will work in partnership with all cities to support economic growth, protect Luke AFB and to support the State of Arizona.

Councilmember Knaack stated she was proud to represent the Barrel District, which is one of six districts in Glendale. She noted it did not matter if you lived in or represented the Cholla, Sahuaro, Barrel, Ocotillo, Cactus or the Yucca Districts, they were all Glendalians and will work together for the greater good of the entire city. They will not let anything or anyone diminish the greatness of this city, this state or this country. She once again thanked everyone.

### **OATH OF OFFICE – NORMA S. ALVAREZ**

The Honorable Manual Delgado, Jr., Court Hearing Officer, Glendale City Court, Administered the Oath of Office to Norma S. Alvarez, Councilmember-Elect Ocotillo District.

Esta noche está dedicada a mis padres, Alfredo Silva que falleció en Junio, 1983 y Maria Silva que esta aquí presente.

Councilmember Alvarez stated she dedicated today to her parents. She thanked them for making her into the person she is and the Councilmember she intends to be.

Councilmember Alvarez said it's been said that a thankful heart was the parent of all virtues. So first and foremost, she was thankful for the many blessings, family, and friends with which God has showered her.

Councilmember Alvarez stated she was also thankful for her husband Fernando. (Gracias por tu apoyo y paciencia).

Councilmember Alvarez stated she was thankful for her sons, Fernando Jr. and Jeffrey, and for her grandchildren, Gabriella, Ariel, Noah and Jason.

Councilmember Alvarez stated she was also thankful for her brothers and sisters, Emerita, Paul, Lupe, Joe, Alfredo Jr., Libby, Frank, Ramiro, Protacio, Katy, Becky as well as very thankful for her friends, volunteers, and supporters. She stated all of them made the difference between losing and winning the election.

Councilmember Alvarez noted all of their suggestions were valued and appreciated, but added after hotdog cookouts in every neighborhood, she never wants to eat another hotdog again.

Councilmember Alvarez was often asked “who ran my campaign?” Her answer was always Team Alvarez.

Councilmember Alvarez said she owed much gratitude to her consulting team. Their support was her source of strength and motivation to get through the campaign.

Councilmember Alvarez said they did not have the power of money, but they had the power of the people! She thanked the residents of Ocotillo District for their trust and faith.

Councilmember Alvarez stated that many viewed the diversity of the Ocotillo District as a weakness; however she disagrees. She views their diversity as their strength. She stated that during this election, she broke bread with individuals from every race, color, religion and political belief, young and old, poor and wealthy, skeptics and believers.

The residents of the Ocotillo District are some of the most dynamic, powerful and careful individuals in their city. From the downtown small business owners who work hard each day to make Glendale a special place to shop, dine or visit, to the single moms doing their best to keep their family afloat, to educators who have spent their lives and careers caring about the future success of their children.

Councilmember Alvarez stated she loves her district, and believes in the power of its people and its neighborhoods.

Ocotillo District residents are no different than any other. They want and deserve clean and safe neighborhoods. She remarked that it was why she will not tolerate any negative attitude because residents are listening to what they say and do.

Councilmember Alvarez stated she looks forward to working with the Mayor and Council to build a stronger community. She looks forward to working with Ed Beasley and staff to maintain and improve the quality of life of their residents and also provide the excellent customer service for which Glendale is known.

Councilmember Alvarez stated as a child growing up in Glendale, she experienced discrimination and hardships on a daily basis. Through these experiences, she learned the importance of family, of caring for others and organizing to make a difference.

Councilmember Alvarez noted it was her parents who taught her how to stand up for what she believed in. Her parents instilled in her the value that you must first serve others before you can lead them.

Councilmember Alvarez stated that after 30 years of serving others as a city employee assisting those who have fallen on difficult times...after a lifetime of serving the community through the partnerships with schools, neighborhood organizations, non-profits, churches and families.... after serving on numerous boards and committees over the last three decades.... she was more than ready to serve the residents of Glendale in the leadership role as Councilmember for the Ocotillo District.

Councilmember Alvarez blessed and thanked everyone attending tonight. She also acknowledged several people by name in the audience who helped in the Ocotillo District and have made a huge difference.

Ms. Watters asked for a round of applause for the newly-inducted Council and invited all the Councilmembers to the podium for the official group photo.

Mayor Scruggs stated the ceremony had come to a close and thanked everyone for attending tonight. She invited back Staff Sgt. Alisha Pasco, Luke Air Force Base, to lead them with the closing hymn.

The meeting ended with “America, the Beautiful” performed by Staff Sgt. Alisha Pasco, Luke Air Force Base.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:55 p.m.

Pamela Hanna

---

Pamela Hanna – City Clerk